| **Student Name:** Hanna Zhang |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house believes that countries should spend rather than save during a debt crisis |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 72 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: This is a 4 minutes’ reply speech.]  Excellent restating of perspectives of the debate on the short-term gains vs long-term risks   * However, while I understand that Opp minimises the risks, what about the comparative that Prop is asking from you on who is taking more meaningful measures to reverse the recession? * While you’re saying it could get worse, the status quo is still quite bad and could spiral, so how does austerity deal with the current recessionary cycle?   + Because Prop actually has an interventionist measure that interrupts the recession, so it isn’t clear what Opp's sustainable path to recovery is.   On the state of the government:   * Well done recharacterising the state of the government’s structure and why we cannot trust them to implement stimulus measures effectively.   + But here, can we engage with Prop’s analysis that the state in a debt crisis will be sensible with how they spend their money?     - Explain that in a debt crisis, that alone proves that the state is likely leaning inefficiency to begin with. * Here, reinforce that the state doesn’t have sufficient funds for meaningful austerity measures. * Explain why even governments with a lot of money can run out of it because of the severity of the crisis worsening, coupled with external reasons that caused the crisis potentially getting worse over time.   The above could be reinforced with the broader clash on the effectiveness of stimulus due to uncontrollable external market conditions as well. Point out that stimulus packages require a lot of important conditions in order to work effectively.   * Then explain why you think Prop will fail in meeting these conditions!   + E.g. Instead of saying the state won’t be efficient, tell me why the state definitely is not efficient because they’re the reason why we’re in the debt crisis to begin with.     - What are these precise economic policies that the state needs to do but may not do?   Good reinforcement on the question of market confidence:   * I appreciate the reinforcement on why reducing debt could restore the confidence to an extent, but we need to be more engaging with Prop’s reasoning here.   + They’re explaining that increased returns for investment and showcasing economic growth would also be improving market confidence.   On the clash of long-term stability:   * Strong reinforcement of your low-risk pathways. * Good point focusing on the counterproductive effects of stimulus, point out that this flips Prop’s own burden on economic recovery of the debt crisis.   Good job offering POIs.  4.12 | | | | | | |